

International Research Journal of Pure & Applied Chemistry 12(4): 1-14, 2016, Article no.IRJPAC.28775 ISSN: 2231-3443, NLM ID: 101647669

SCIENCEDOMAIN international www.sciencedomain.org

A DFT Study on Stepwise Fluorinated Methylenecyclopentane \rightleftharpoons 1-Methylcyclopentene **System**

Ghassab M. Al-Mazaideh1*, Wafa B. Ejlidi² and Salim M. Khalil¹

 1 Department of Chemistry and Chemical Technology, Faculty of Science, Tafila Technical University, P.O.Box 179, Tafila 66110, Jordan. $²$ Department of Chemistry, School of Basic Science, Libyan Academy for Graduate Studies,</sup> P.O.Box 79031, Tripoli, Libya.

Authors' contributions

This work was carried out in collaboration between all authors. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

Article Information

DOI: 10.9734/IRJPAC/2016/28775 Editor(s): (1) Wolfgang Linert, Institute of Applied Synthetic Chemistry Vienna University of Technology Getreidemarkt, Austria. Reviewers: (1) Angélica Machi Lazarin, Universidade Estadual de Maringá, Maringá, Brazil. (2) A. Veerareddy, R&D, suven lifesciences, India. (3) Joseph C. Sloop, Georgia Gwinnett College, USA. Complete Peer review History: http://www.sciencedomain.org/review-history/16137

Original Research Article

Received 4th August 2016 Accepted 19th August 2016 Published 10th September 2016

ABSTRACT

Density functional theory (DFT) calculations have been performed to calculate the optimized geometries of stepwise fluorinated methylenecyclopentanes and 1-methylcyclopentenes. Increasing the number of fluorine atoms caused a destabilization of methylenecyclopentane. Perfluorinated 1-methylcyclopentene was found to be present in substantial concentration. This is supported by calculations of the Gibbs free energy and isodesmic reactions. These results are compared with fluorinated methyenecyclopropane and the fluorinated cyclopentanones keto-enol systems. Enthalpies, entropies and dipole moments are reported.

Keywords: Fluorinated methylenecyclopentane; tautomerism; DFT.

*Corresponding author: E-mail: gmazideh@ttu.edu.jo;

1. INTRODUCTION

Recently [1] we have studied methylenecyclopropane / 1-methylcyclopropene system (Scheme 1) and have shown that methylenecyclopropane is 11.535 kcal/mol more stable than 1-methylcyclopropene.

Scheme 1

This was confirmed by a positive Gibbs free energy, ∆G (∆G = 11.615 kcal/mol), which indicates that this system is non-spontaneous and methylenecyclopropane is more stable than 1-methylcyclopropene. Also, it was found [1] that an increase in the number of substituting fluorine atoms causes a destabilization of methylenecyclopropane. This system [1] was compared with the cyclopropanone and cyclopropenol system [2] (Scheme 2) and found that an increase in the number of fluorine atoms also causes a destabilization of cyclopropanone.

Scheme 2

Also, we have studied cyclopentanone and its enol [3] (Scheme 3), and

Scheme 3

have shown that perfluorination destabilizes the ketone form at the expense of the enol form.

In this paper we study the effect of the methylene group on the five-membered ring and also of the stepwise fluorination of this methylenecyclopentane /1-methylcyclopentene system in order to compare this effect with the recent previous work [1–3]. While much work has been done on the reactions of methylenecyclo-pentane [4-11], the stepwise fluorination of methylencyclopentane has not been examined.

This study will employ DFT/B3LYP (G 03, Revision B.03) [12] is applied to examine first the methylenecyclopentane/1-methylcyclopentene system (Scheme 4) and then the stepwise fluorinated methylenecyclopentane /1-methylcyclopentene system. All calculations will be performed in the gas phase at 298.15 K.

methylenecyclopentane **(1)** 1-methylcyclopentene **(2)**

Scheme 4

2. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Density functional theory (DFT) calculations [12] are used to calculate fully the optimized geometries of fluorinated methylencyclopentane and 1-methylcyclopentene. The molecular structures of the fluorinated methylenecyclopentane (**1**) / 1-methylcyclopentene (**2**) systems and Mulliken atomic charges are given in Fig. 1.

The calculated entropies, enthalpies and dipole moments of 21 compounds are listed in Table 1.

The calculated Gibbs free energies and isodesmic reactions, are given in Tables 2 and 3 respectively.

2.1 Parent Compounds

DFT calculations have shown that the difference in energy between compound **2** and compound **1** is 0.008943 Hartrees (5.612 kcal/mol) as shown in Table 1, suggesting that **2** is more stable than **1** by 5.612 kcal/mol. This is confirmed by thermodynamic calculations (Table 2) which shows a negative Gibbs free energy (∆G = - 4.614 kcal/mol) indicating a spontaneous reaction and that 1-methylcyclopentene is the more stable (Scheme 5).

Fig. 1. Molecular structure of fluorinated methylenecyclopentanes and 1-methylcyclopentenes with Mulliken atomic charges in parenthesis

Scheme 5

Compound	$\overline{\mathbf{s}}$	н	μ
1	75.464	-231.661846	0.606
$\mathbf{2}$	72.116	-231.670789	0.247
3	77.438	-329.438723	2.252
4	77.397	-329.462072	1.976
5	76.426	-329.446368	2.208
6	78.578	-329.440658	1.935
	76.489	-329.446440	2.752
8	78.518	-427.212426	1.856
9	81.869	-427.238649	2.015
10	82.454	-427.235813	3.059
11	80.719	-427.244527	3.029
12	82.126	-525.012274	2.239
13	86.240	-525.036999	2.015
14	86.223	-622.785610	2.391
15	91.484	-622.811321	1.333
16	90.891	-720.557933	4.227
17	96.583	-720.584404	3.377
18	95.441	-818.350420	3.151
19	100.815	-818.377611	3.162
20	99.839	-916.143831	3.796
21	99.366	-916.172101	3.685

Table 1. Calculated entropy S (cal/mol. K), Enthalpy H (Hartrees), Dipole moment µ (Debye) of fluorinated methylenecyclopentanes and 1-methylcyclopentenes (see Fig. 1 for numbering)

1 Hartree = 627.5095 kcal/mol

Comparing this energy with that of the keto-enol system $(\Delta G = 5.311 \text{ kcal/mol})$ [3], suggests that the carbonyl group stabilizes the five membered ring more than that of methylene group. This agrees with the work on methylenecyclopropane [1]. It was found that in all alkene isomerizations [13], the forward reaction is favored far more than in their ketone-to-enol counterparts, which agrees with present work. This ΔG value (ΔG = -4.614 kcal/mol) will be taken as reference for determining the relative stability of fluorinated methylenecyclopentanes and 1-methylcyclopentenes.

2.2 Relative Stability of the Fluorinated Methylenecyclopentane $\overline{}$ 1-**Methylcyclopentene System**

Introduction of fluorine atom causes a change in the atomic Mulliken charges of methylenecyclopentane \equiv 1-methylcyclopentene system, mainly where the fluorine atom is attached (Fig. 1).

2.2.1 Effect of one F atom

There are two possibilities, case **a** and case **b**:

a) 2-fluoromethylenecyclopentane **3** (Fig. 1) is an unsymmetrical compound and has

two possibilities of forming **4** and **5** (Scheme 6). Compound **4** is formed from an H9 shift from C2 (compound **3**), while compound **5** is formed by an H3 shift from C5.

The H9 in compound **3** is more acidic (+ 0.134) than H3 (+ 0.129). So the compound **4** formed from H9 shift may be favorable. This is indicated by No. 2 in Table 2, where $\Delta G = -14.640$ kcal/mol is less than of compound **5** (ΔG = -4.496 kcal/mol, No. 3 in Table 2). This suggests that the transformation from **3** to 4 is more likely to occur than from **3** to **5**, i.e. compound **4** is more stable than **5.** The stabilization effect is also supported by using the isodesmic reactions [14-21]. A negative value for the reaction indicates a less stable, and a positive value a more stable product. It can be seen that *∆*Hrxn = 10.133 kcal/mol of compound **4** (No.2 in Table 3) is more positive than that of compound **5** (*∆*Hrxn = 0.279 kcal/mol, No.3 in Table 3), suggesting **4** is a stable relative to **5.**

b) 3-fluoromethylenecyclopentane **6** (Fig. 1) is unsymmetrical. The compound that might be formed is **7** resulting from an H9 shift on the C2 (Scheme 7). The ∆G value for transformation from **6** to **7** is calculated to be -3.005 kcal/mol (No.4 in Table 2).

Table 2. Gibbs free energy (∆G) of fluorinated methylenecyclopentanes and 1- methylcyclopentene

Table 2. (continued)

Scheme 7

As expected, the F atom has a greater inductive effect when it is adjacent to methylene group (Scheme 6), than when it is further away from methylene group (Scheme 7).

2.2.2 Effect of two F atoms

There are six possibilities, but only the two most possibilities (a and b) are to be considered, since

a distal F substituent from methylene group has little effect on the five- membered ring (similar to that shown for a single F atom).

a) 2,5-Difluoromethylenecyclopentane **8** is a symmetrical compound (Fig. 1). The possible compound formed is compound **9** resulting from H9 shift on C2 or H3 shift on C5 (Scheme 8).

The ∆G value is calculated to be -17.454 kcal/mol (No.5 in Table 2), which is less than the parent compound (No.1 in Table 2) indicating the increase in the compound **9** stability. This is also supported by the isodesmic reaction where *∆*Hrxn = 10.589 kcal/mol of **9** (No.7 in Table 3), is more positive than that of **8** (*∆*Hrxn = -0.255 kcal/mol, No.6 in Table 3) indicating that **9** is relatively more stable than **8.** (i.e the two fluorine atoms destabilized the methylenecyclopentane).

Table 3. Evaluation of substituent effects on methyelencyclopentanes and 1-methylcyclopentenes via isodesmic reactions

Table 3. (continued)

*∆*H = *∑ ∆*Hproduct - *∑ ∆*Hreactant

b) 2,2-Difluoromethylenecyclopentane **10** (Fig. 1) is unsymmetrical. The compound that might be formed is **11** resulting from an H3 shift on C_5 (Scheme 9).

The ∆G value of **10** is calculated to be -4.950 kcal/mol (No.6 in Table 2), which is less than that of the parent compound ($\Delta G = -4.614$ kcal/mol). This suggests that the two fluorine atoms slightly destabilize the methylenecyclopentane. It can be seen from Table 2, that ∆G value of compound **8** to **9** (No.5 in Table 2) is less than that of compound **10** to **11** (No.6 in Table 2), suggesting the greater effect of the two fluorine atoms in case a compared to that of case b (two F atoms on the same C atom). This agrees with the

recent work [1], on stepwise fluorinated methylenecyclo-propane.

2.2.3 Effect of three F atoms

There are five possibilities, and the most stable possibility is considered for the same reason mentioned before. 2,5,5-Trifluoromethylenecyclopentane **12** (Fig. 1) has one possibility of compound formation. The compound formed is a compound **13** resulting from H9 shift on C2. The positive charge of H9 (+ 0.166) in compound **12** (Scheme 10) is more acidic than that of the parent methylenecyclopentane proton (+ 0.144) (Fig. 1).

So the compound formation may have a relatively higher stability than the parent compound. This is indicated by No.7 in Table 2, where $\Delta G = -16.742$ kcal/mol is less than the parent compound ($\Delta G = -4.614$ kcal/mol)

This result is also supported by the isodesmic reactions, where *∆*Hrxn = 10.747 kcal/mol of **13** (No.11 in Table 3) is more positive than that of **12** (*∆*Hrxn = 0.843 kcal/mol, No.10 in Table 3). Thus **13** is favored over **12**.

2.2.4 Effect of four F atoms

There are four possibilities, and only the most stable possibility is considered.

2,3,5,5-tetrafluoromethylenecyclopentane **14** (Fig. 1). The compound formed is a compound **15** resulting from H9 shift on C2 (Scheme 11).

The positive charge of H9 (+ 0.177) in compound **14** (Scheme 11) is more acidic than that of the parent methylenecyclopentane proton (+ 0.144) (Fig. 1). So the compound formation may have a relatively higher stability than the parent compound. This is indicated by No.8 in Table 2, where $\Delta G = -17.702$ kcal/mol is less than the parent compound ($\Delta G = -4.614$ kcal/mol). This result is also supported by the isodesmic reactions, where *∆*Hrxn = 9.617 kcal/mol of **15 (**No.13 in Table 3) is more positive than that of **14** (*∆*Hrxn = -0.906 kcal/mol, No.12 in Table 3). Thus the compound **15** is favored over compound **14**.

2.2.5 Effect of five F atoms

There are three possibilities, and the most stable possibility is considered 2,3,4,5,5-pentafluoromethylenecyclopentane **16** (Fig. 1). The compound that might be formed is **17** resulting from an H9 shift on the C2 (Scheme 12).

The ∆G value is calculated to be -18.308 kcal/mol (No.9 in Table 2), which is less than the parent compound (No.1 in Table 2) indicating the increase in the compound **17** stability. This is

also supported by the isodesmic reaction where *∆*Hrxn = 11.195 kcal/mol of **17** (No.15 in Table 3) is more positive than that of **16** (*∆*Hrxn = 0.196 kcal/mol, No.14 in Table 3) indicating that **17** is relatively more stable than **16**.

2.2.6 Effect of six F atoms

There are two possibilities, and the most stable possibility is considered 2,3,4,4,5,5-hexafluorocyclopentane **18** (Fig. 1). The compound formed is a compound **19** (Scheme 13).

The ΔG = -18.665 kcal/mol is less than the parent compound ($\Delta G = -4.614$ kcal/mol). This result is also supported by isodesmic reaction, where *∆*Hrxn = 10.653 kcal/mol of **19** (No.17 in Table 3) is more positive than that of **18** (*∆*Hrxn = -0.798 kcal/mol, No.16 in Table 3), indicating that **19** is relatively more stable than **18**.

2.2.7 Effect of seven F atoms

2,3,3,4,4,5,5-heptafluoromethylenecyclopentane **20** (2H-perfluoromethylenecyclopentane) (Fig. 1) has one possibility of compound formation. The compound formed is a compound **21** resulting from H9 shift on C2. The positive charge of H9 in compound **20** is + 0.186 (Scheme 14), which is more acidic than that of the parent methylenecyclopentane proton (+ 0.144) (Fig. 1).

So the product formation may be favored by a relatively higher stability compared to the parent compound. This is indicated by No.11 in Table 2, where $\Delta G = -17.599$ kcal/mol is less than the parent compound ($\Delta G = -4.614$ kcal/mol). This result is also supported by isodesmic reactions, where *∆*Hrxn = 11.492 kcal/mol of **21** (No.19 in Table 3) is more positive than that of **20** (*∆*Hrxn = -0.636 kcal/mol, No.18 in Table 3). This suggests a relative stability of compound **21**. Thus **21** is favored over **20**, which agrees with the previous works on the methylenecyclopropane/1-methylcyclopropene system [1], where 1-methylcyclopropene is favored over methylenecyclopropane, and the keto-enol system [2,22], where the enol form is favored over the ketone form.

The calculated Mulliken charge distribution in compound **20** may give a plausible explanation for its destabilization. The calculated charges at carbon atoms 2 and 5 are more positive in **20** than in **1** (Scheme 15). The positive charge adjacent to methylene group is destabilizing due to the electrostatic repulsion between the two carbon atoms C2 and C5, and C1. Therefore, this repulsion might be responsible for the destabilization of **20**. The hydrogen atom H9 becomes more acidic (+0.186) in compound **20** than in compound **1** (+0.144). Increasing the acidity of the hydrogen atom H9 is likely to be important for the easy formation of compound **21** (Scheme 14). Thus the compound **21** is favored over compound **20** in a similar explanation to that given in previous works on 2H-perfluoromethylencyclopropane [1], 2H-perfluorocyclobutanone [14], and 2H-perfluorocyclopentanone [3,23,24].

Scheme 14

2.3 Dipole Moment of Fluorinated Methylenecyclopentane and 1-methylcyclopentene System

Stepwise fluorination affects the dipole moment of all compounds, as shown in Table 1. Introduction of a fluorine atom into methyelencyclopentane increases the dipole
moment from 0.606 Debye (1 without moment from 0.606 Debye (1 fluorination) to 2.752 Debye (**3** with fluorination). This is due to the presence of the fluorine atom with the constructive resultant with a $-CH₂$ group, which agrees with the recent work [1] on stepwise fluorination of methylenecyclo-propane. It can be seen from Table 1, that introduction of two fluorine atoms increases the dipole moment from 1.856 Debye in compound **8** to 3.059 Debye in compound **10**. Thus, as the number of fluorine atoms increases, the

dipole moments also increase, but not in a uniform fashion. This depends on constructive resultant of F atom with a $-CH₂$ group. Similarly, the changes in the dipole moments of fluorinated 1-methylcyclopentenes can be explained.

 $_{\mathsf{H}_9}$

 $(+0.160)$

 $(+0.144)$

 (-0.305)

 H_{8}

 $\omega_{\rm H_{10}}$

 H_7

į

2

3. CONCLUSION

It can be concluded that the 1-methylcyclopentene is more stable than methylenecyclopentane by 5.612 kcal/mol. The methyl group stabilizes the five membered ring less than the carbonyl group. The stability of methylenecyclopentane was found to decrease on fluorination similar to that in the case of methylene- cyclopropane. Perfluorinated 1-methylcyclopentene was found to be present in substantial concentration, similar to that in the case of cyclopentanone and its

enol. These results were confirmed by Gibbs free energy calculations and isodesmic reactions.

COMPETING INTERESTS

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

REFERENCES

1. a) Al-Mazaideh GM, Enwisry RA, Khalil SM. Effect of substituents on Methylenecyclobutane / 1-Methylcyclobutene system. Inter. Res. J. of Pure and Appl. Chem. 2016;12(3):1-10. b) Khalil SM. A DFT study on the stepwise

fluorinated methylenecyclopropane 1-Methylcyclopropene system. Z. Naturforsch. 2008;63a:42-48.

- 2. El-Alali A, Marashdeh AA, Khalil AM. Atheoretical study of substituted stepwise fluorinated cyclopropanone keto-enol system. Z. Naturforsch. 2003;58a:749- 755.
- 3. a) Al-Msiedeen AM, Al-Mazaideh GM, Khalil SM. A theoretical study of the enol contents of cyclohexanone, cyclopentanone and acetone. Amer. Chem. Sci. J. 2016;13(4):1-8.

b) Al-Noeemat MS, Al-Ma'ani RA, Khalil SM. A theoretical study of substituted cyclopentanones and their enols. A theoretical study of substituted cyclopentanones and their enols. Z. Naturforsch. 2003;58a:738-748.

- 4. Volman DH. Interpretation of electron spin resonance evidence for the mechanism of free-radical-induced reactions of methylenecyclobutane and methylenecyclopentane J. Phys. Chem. 1971;75(5):714-716.
- 5. Yamamoto Y, Nakagai Y, Ohkoshi N, Itoh K. Ruthenium(II)-catalyzed isomerselective cyclization of 1,6-Dienes leading to exo-Methylenecyclopentanes: Unprecedented cycloisomerization mechanism involving Ruthenacyclopentane(hydrido) intermediate. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 2001; 123(26):6372-6380.
- 6. Huval CC, Singleton DA. Versatile [3 + 2] methylenecyclopentane annulations of unactivated and electron-rich olefins with [(trimethylsilyl)methylene] cyclopropane dicarbox- ylates. J. Org. Chem. 1994; 59(8):2020-2024.
- 7. Singleton DA, Church KM. The stereoselective construction of (Z)-3-aryl-2 fluoroalkenoates. J. Org. Chem. 1990; 55(16):4780- 4784.
- 8. Volman DH. Interpretation of electron spin resonance evidence for the mechanism of free-radical-induced reactions of methylenecyclobutane and methylenecyclopentane. J. Phys. Chem. 1971;75(15):714-716.
- 9. Black KA, Wilsey S, Houk KN. Dissociative and associative mechanisms of cope rearrangements of fluorinated 1,5 hexadienes and 2,2'-Bis-methylenecyclopentanes. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 2003;125(22):6715-6724.
- 10. Takeda K, Yoshida H, Hayashi K, Okamura S. Electron spin resonance study of radiation- and free radical-induced reactions of methylenecycloalkanes (Special issue on physical, chemical and biological effects of gamma radiation, VIII). Bull. Inst. Chem. Res. Kyoto Univ. 1967;45(1):55-62.
- 11. Rondan NG, Houk KN. Theory of stereoselection in conrotatory electrocyclic reactions of substituted cyclobutenes J. Am. Chem. Soc. 1985;107(7):2099-2111.
- 12. Frisch MJ, Trucks GW, Schlegel HB, Scuseria GE, Robb MA, Cheeseman JR, Montgomery JA Jr, Vreven T, Kudin KN, Burant JC, Millam JM, Iyengar SS, Tomasi J, Barone V, Mennucci B, Cossi M, Scalmani G, Rega N, Petersson GA, Nakatsuji H, Hada M, Ehara M, Toyota K, Fukuda R, Hasegawa J, Ishida M, Nakajima T, Honda Y, Kitao O, Nakai H, Klene M, Li X, Knox JE, Hratchian HP, Cross JB, Adamo C, Jaramillo J, Gomperts R, Stratmann RE, Yazyev O, Austin AJ, Cammi R, Pomelli C, Ochterski JW, Ayala PY, Morokuma K, Voth GA, Salvador P, Dannenberg JJ, Zakrzewski VG, Dapprich S, Daniels AD, Strain MC, Farkas O, Malick DK, Rabuck AD, Raghavachari K, Foresman JB, Ortiz JV, Cui Q, Baboul AG, Clifford S, Cioslowski J, Stefanov BB, Liu G, Liashenko A, Piskorz P, Komaromi I, Martin RL, Fox DJ, Keith T, Al-Laham MA, Peng CY, Nanayakkara A, Challacombe M, Gill PMW, Johnson B, Chen W, Wong MW, Gonzalez C, Pople JA. Gaussian,Inc., Pittsburgh PA; 2003.
- 13. Lindner PE, Lemal DM. Energetics of fluoroalkene double bond isomeri-zations. J. Amer. Chem. Soc. 1997;119(14):3267- 3273.
- 14. Sway MI, Al-Shawabkeh ID, Khalil SM. A theoretical study of substituted cyclobutanones and their enols. Z. Naturforsch. 2004;59a:838-844.
- 15. Hehre WH, Ditchfield R, Radom L, Pople JA. Molecular orbital theory of the electronic structure of organic compounds. V. Molecular theory of bond separation. J. Amer. Chem. Soc. 1970;92(16):4796- 4801.
- 16. Lien MH, Hopkinson AC. A theoretical study of monosubstituted allyl cations. J. Phys. Chem. 1984;88(8):1513-1517.
- 17. Khalil SM, Jarjis HM. A theoretical study of fulvene radical ions. Z. Naturforsch. 1990; 46a:247-255.
- 18. Jarjis HM, Khalil SM. MINDO-Forces calculations of allyl and crotyl systems. Part 1. Theoretical study with complete optimization of geometry. J. Chem. Soc. Perkin Trans. 1956;2:1701-1704.
- 19. Reynolds WF, Dais P, Taft RW, Topsom RD. The response of substituents to pi-

electron demand. Tetrahedron Letters. 1981;22(19):1795-1797.

- 20. Al-Halasah WF, Khalil SM. MINDO-forces study on the Keto-Enol Tautomerism of α substituted acetaldehydes $XCH₂$ CH=O (X $=$ H, F, OH, CN, NH₂, NO₂, CH₃, CF₃, OCH₃): Comparison with acetyl derivatives. Z. Naturforsch. 2004;59a:980.
- 21. Salim BM, Khalil SM. MINDO-forces study on substituted nitromethane acinitromethane tautomerism. Z. Naturforsch. 2005;60a:47-53.
- 22. Lindner PE, Lemal DM. Perfluorinated cyclic and acyclic keto−enol systems: A remarkable contrast. J. Amer. Chem. Soc. 1997;119(14):3259-3266.
- 23. Lindner PE, Lemal DM. Highly fluorinated cyclopentanones and their enols. J. Org. Chem. 1996;61(15):5109-5115.
- 24. Kwon Y. Keto–enol systems of some fluorinated cyclopentanones and cyclobutanones: Density functional theory calculations. J. Mol. Struct.: Theochem. 1999;488(1-3):93-99.

___ © 2016 Al-Mazaideh et al.; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

> Peer-review history: The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here: http://sciencedomain.org/review-history/16137